

From: Donna Oliver
To: Alisa Morningstar; Donald Beers
Date: 2/17/05 2:41:33 PM
Subject: Phase 2 Evaluation Document

Dr. Beers and Alisa,

Attached is the final copy of the Phase 2 Committee Evaluation document.

After the conclusion of Phase 2, there has been some confusion about which version of the evaluation document accurately represents the findings of the Phase 2 Committee.


This version has been reviewed for accuracy by me and the following Phase 2 committee members who assisted in the development of the document: Linda Morrell, Gail May, Charles Sprayberry and John Graham.

This version should be filed as the official record maintained by the Procurement Department.

Donna

Donna Oliver, Director
Curriculum & Instruction Division
Cobb County School District
donna.oliver@cobbk12.org
Phone: 770-426-3594
FAX: 770-528-6736

CC: Jill Vestal; Kimberly Quinn



010536

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Evaluation

Draft

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple		HP		
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4		
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes		
6.1 Reporting, Delivery & Installation Plan	8	8	Detailed deployment plan. Image loaded at factory.	7	Detailed deployment plan. Image loaded locally.	4	Deployment plan provided. No local presence at this time.	4	Deployment plan provided. No responsibility for developing image.
6.2 Imaging, Delivery & Installation Plan	8	8	Detailed deployment plan. Image loaded at factory.	7	Detailed deployment plan. Image loaded locally.	4	Deployment plan provided. No local presence at this time.	4	Deployment plan provided. No responsibility for developing image.
6.3 Property Control Plan	2	1	Meets requirement. System provided. Does not track software changes.	2	Meets requirement by providing file that can be loaded into Remedy. Remedy can provide web interface.	2	Meets requirement with OPTS system developed for Maine.	1	Does not meet all minimum requirements
6.4 Warranty and Support Plan - on-site support or depot pickup	10	10	On-site support, next business day	10	On-site support, next business day	7	Depot pickup, 48 hours	8	On-site support, turn around time unclear
6.5 Loaner Laptop Provided	5	5	Loaner provided same day if laptop can not be repaired	5	Loaner provided same day if laptop can not be repaired	3	Loaner provided if not repaired in 48 hours	2	Will provide loaners. Not clear when provided. 1/9
6.6 Provisions for Broken Screens	2	2	Extended warranty coverage for additional cost	2	Thinkpad Protection coverage included in price.	0	Not addressed in proposal.	1	All Risk solution limited to 1 broken screen per year.
6.7 Location of Spare Parts (on-site or off-site)	3	3	On-site	3	On-site	1	On-site	3	On-site
6.8 Requests for Service	3	2	On-site & via phone	2	On-site & via phone	1	Via phone	1	Via phone
6.9 Dedicated Help Desk	2	2	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk	2	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk	2	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk	0	Regular help desk
6.10 Battery Consumption	10	9	Provides one battery per year	10	Replaces batteries as part of lease, no limit on numbers	9	Provides one battery per year	4	Includes one additional battery with some spares available
6.11 Battery Warranty	5	5	Defective when battery will not hold 100% charge	3	Defective when battery holds charge for less than 60 minutes	3	Defective when battery holds a charge for less than 60 minutes	1	Defective when battery will not hold a charge
Subsections:	40	38		47		30		20	

010537

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn Evaluation

Draft

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple		HP	
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4	
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Points Possible	Points Awarded
LEARNING	40	40	40	40	40	40	40	40
Subsections:								
Initial Staff Training	8	8	8	8	6	5	5	5
Initial Student/Parent Training	10	10	10	10	7	3	3	3
Annual New Staff and Student Training	2	2	2	2	0.5	1	1	1
Technology Support Staff Training	5	5	4	5	5	4	4	4
Ongoing Curriculum Technology Integration Training	15	15	7	12.5	11	11	11	11
								010533

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Evaluation

Draft

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple		HP					
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4					
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes					
6.8 Program Instructional Evaluation	10	10	Two national research organizations with experience of similar scope/scale. Evaluation results led to communication plan for immediate & long-term info to community & CCSD. 3 phases timeline to begin before deployment. Annual activities include questionnaires, survey, test data, quantitative & qualitative data analysis, semi-annual & annual conclusion/recommendations. Longitudinal analysis of student cohorts for achievement gains, attitudes, skills, behaviors, & post-secondary education (as relevant). Teacher/administrators evaluation to measure changes in professional routines, productivity, and school/home communication. Large scale quantitative analysis included. Pre & posttest data available each yr. Comparative District analysis at the end of phase 3. Digital portfolio assessment component.	10	10	National research organization with experience of similar scope/scale. Formative/process & summative (outcome) evaluation groups to include students, teachers, administrators, parents, & other key stakeholders. Qualitative & quantitative data sources. Formative evaluation data: project documentation, field observations, focus groups, individual interviews, and written surveys. Summative evaluation data: state data sources & other standardized sources. Comparative school design. Clarity assessment/review meetings w/ key CCSD staff. Collaboration with CCSD to determine evaluation focus. Timeline includes data collection points & reports. Additional option for in-depth case study for yr 2 & 3. Final evaluation reports provided to the public at end of contract time.	5	5	State research organization. Evaluation components focusing on achievement in writing. 3-yr implementation with subsequent application/changes from traditional practice and impact on student outcomes. Evaluation plan includes data collection. 20% sampling of CCSD population. Evaluation concludes at the end of year 3.	3	3	The evaluation design includes 450 middle school and 450 high school students at four CCSD schools. Timeline for HS students begins year 2 and year 3 for MS students. Stratified samples of teacher performance assessments are proposed. CCSD parents and other stakeholders are not included in the project design. Timeliness for data collections and reports are to be determined.

010539

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn Evaluation

Draft

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple		HP		
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4		
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes		
ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS	20	17		19		9			
Subsections:									
6.5 Insurance	10	10	Meets requirements. \$40 premium/\$100 deductible.	10	Meets and exceeds requirements: \$40 premium/\$100 deductible. Collects premiums. Accepts installment payments from students qualifying for free & reduced. Includes broken screens. Local claims processing, local repairs.	0	Names Software as insurer. Premium not limited to \$50. Excludes damages from environmental causes i.e. heat, cold, dampness, dryness. Requires COSD to collect premiums.	0	Payment of premium is due up front. If financed over 4 years, exceeds premium limit. Limits coverage for broken screens to 1 per year
6.9 Disposal Plan	2	2	Provided	2	Provided	2	Provided		
6.10 Safety and Security System	2	0	Does not meet requirement.	2	Meets requirement for additional cost.	2	Meets requirement with Apple Remote Desktop 2 application.	2	Meets requirement for cost of \$17.88 per unit.
6.11 Value Added Options	5	4	Communication plan includes public accountability for successful project. Certification for Tech Staff at n/c. Logack tracking software included with ins.; \$100 deductible waived if unit stolen. EDTV programming, Instructional Quality Toolkit. Proposal provides 3 program evaluations.	4	Communication Plan Hardware Durability Rapid Restore Access IBM Function	3	In the Suite Communication Plan	0	
6.14 ISP Options for Home Use	1	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates
TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS	10	28		25		18			
Subsections:									
6.12 Technical Specifications Ability to Meet Minimum Requirements	10	8	No built-in mic, battery charge is less than 7 hours, wireless a/b/g	9	Battery charge is less than 7 hours, wireless a/b/g	6	No PC/MCIA slot, battery charge is less than 7 hours, wireless b/g	7	No Built-in mic, battery charge less than 7 hours, wireless b/g.
Physical Evaluation of Equipment	4	2	No built-in mic	2	Bulky external battery	2	Adapter required for external video display.	2	Battery difficult to remove, no built-in mic

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Evaluation

Draft

Vendor:		Dell		IBM		Apple		HP	
Current Overall Rank:		1		2		3		4	
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes
Equipment Performance	8	8	Based on Committee developed evaluation	8	Based on Committee developed evaluation	4	Based on Committee developed evaluation	7	Based on Committee developed evaluation
6.13 Network Impact Analysis	8	8	Comprehensive plan and site surveys at no additional cost	6	Provides 160 hours of engineer time, CCSD to pay for surveys	3	Will provide help evaluating WAN links only	1	No specific information provided. Proposal stated HP will work with CCSD.
Subtotal:	160	150	94%	141	88%	98	61%	82	51%
Subsections:	40	0		0		0		0	
Lease/Purchase Cost for Total Solution	20		3-yr \$643.45 per year, 4-yr \$597.69 per year		3-yr \$526.98 per year, 4-yr \$459.89 per year		Original 12" cont.: 3-yr \$449.27 per yr, 4-yr \$363.14 per yr All 14" Superdrixye: 3-yr \$515.84 per yr, 4-yr \$413.14 per yr		Original configuration: 3-yr \$712.54 per yr, 4-yr \$596.23 per yr All cont. (reduced # help calls) 3-yr \$694.57 per yr, 4-yr \$576.75 per yr
Total Cost of Ownership	20								
Total Points	200	150		141		98		82	

010541