

From: Alisa Morningstar
To: Kim Quinn
Date: Thu, Jan 27, 2005 4:07 PM
Subject: Revised Final Eval Document

Kim,

Still a work in progress...
Want to talk to you about the following:

We need to take the network impact analysis into consideration for the technical points and adjust accordingly (I have not done yet)

Need to provide strong justification (based on BAFO info) for the proposed training points - they are a complete reversal of the P2 spread.

I made some other adjustments to points that I recommend we consider - when can we discuss?

I'm still waiting for Donna's input - hopefully tonight.

Alisa Morningstar
Director of Procurement Services
Cobb County School District
6975 Cobb International Blvd.
Kennesaw, GA 30152
Phone: 770-426-3364
Fax: 678-594-8600

The information transmitted is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential, proprietary, and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you received this in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from all computers.



RFP 25-04, Power to Learn

Evaluation

Vendor:		APPLE
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded
INSTALLATION/IMAGING/PROJECT MGMT/PROPERTY CONTROL imaging	20	20
Online Asset Management System		
Project Management Team		
Project Management Plan		
WARRANTY & SUPPORT Warranty and Support	40	40
24X7 Help desk - onsite support/ phone support/on-line support		
Spare/Replacement laptops		

004406

Batteries replacement for non-warranty consumption		
TRAINING	40	40
Initial staff training		
Initial Student/Parent Training		
Annual New Staff and Student Training		
Technology Support Staff Training		
Ongoing Curriculum Technology Integration Training		
PROGRAM INSTRUCTIONAL EVAL	10	7.5
Program Instructional Evaluation		
ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS	20	20
Disposal Plan		
Value Added Options		
TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS	30	30
6.12 Technical Specifications		

Technical Specifications - add'l configuration		
Network Impact Analysis		
Subtotal	160	157.5
		98%
PRICE	40	40.0
Implicit Interest Rate 4 yr lease		
Per Year Cost for Lease/Purchase Cost for Total Solution 4-Yr		
Purchase price		
Price Notes:		

004408

Total Cost of Ownership		
Comments re Partnership		
Total Points	200	197.5

004403

APPLE		Dell		IBM
Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Points Awarded
	15		15	
CCSD responsible for creating & testing image BAFO states: "Certified" images applied at factory		CCSD responsible for creating & testing image Recommended Inspiron solution does not provide factory image; all imaging completed by local installer		
Will provide CCSD with the online asset management system designed and tested in Maine		Online asset management system Does not track software changes		
BAFO states that (7) Apple staff will be dedicated to the CCSD project: 1 Project Manager, 1 Technical Lead, 2 Systems Engineers, 2 Professional Development Consultants, & 1 AppleCare Acct Mgr		Proposal Repsonse outlines: 1 full time dedicated senior program manager; deployment assistant PM, Training Assistant PM, Help Desk Assistant PM, Field Services PM, Asset Management Lead		
Plan Provided		Plan Provided		
	40		40	
4yr warranty provided Daily pick-up and delivery to all schools. Dedicated local repair facility to provide overnight repair service. Depot pickup. Re-imaging stations at each school. See dedicated support staff listed in project management team		4yr warranty provided On-site support next business day for hardware only. Software issues, including re-imaging, responsibility of CCSD. No re-imaging stations proposed. See dedicated support staff listed in project management team		
Dedicated Help Desk number for CCSD 24x7x365 24x7 toll-free support line for students, teachers, parents, administrators. No on-site/on-line capability listed. Telephone only. Tier II HelpDesk support for Tech Leads.		Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365. 24x7 toll-free support line for students, teachers, parents, administrators. Requests can be submitted on-line & via phone		
BAFO 1/19/05 states Apple will repair computer overnight or provide a spare so as to return every user to service within one school day		Loaner provided same day if laptop cannot be repaired		

004410

<p>Original battery w/ system & up to 3 replacement batteries (4 total) for each system. 1/24/05 response indicates a willingness to be flexible regarding the use/allocation of batteries over the 4 yr period. Apple defines a battery as defective if it can not hold power for at least 60 minutes, is less than 1 yr old & has had less than 300 charging cycles.</p>		<p>One battery per year for life of lease. Defective when battery will not hold 100% charge</p>	
30		40	
<p>CCSD requirements met. Recommend initial teacher training at high schools.</p>		<p>CCSD requirements met. Initial training to be conducted at local schools.</p>	
<p>CCSD requirements met</p>		<p>CCSD requirements met.</p>	
<p>Plan to be developed w/ CCSD utilizing Train the Trainer model.</p>		<p>Provide training to 700 additional teachers/year</p>	
<p>9 days of training for 3 groups of 17, additional training will be provided on an as needed basis</p>		<p>Training for District or local school staff. Tutorial available online.</p>	
<p>Regular monthly meetings with ILTs & TISS, Summer immersion trainings, Learning Development Center</p>		<p>Strong link to CCSD standards</p>	
10		10	
<p>Learning & Performance Support Lab at UGA</p>		<p>Dale Mann & MGT</p>	
15		10	
<p>Provided at \$12 per unit.</p>		<p>Provided - 1/24/05 response states \$2.65 for lease options, \$10 for purchase options.</p>	
<p>iLife Suite Mac OS X server solutions: PI - add 7 servers to District to support teacher iBook G4 computers PII - Add 16 replica servers & add 42 storage servers managing 23 RAID Units to CCSD network for HS student iBooks PIII - Add 21 replica servers & 42 storage servers managing 21 RAID units to CCSD network for MS student iBooks This solution provides 5GB network storage per teacher & 500 MB per student.</p>		<p>includes: (5) 1700N B&W networked laser printers and (1) 3000CN color networked laser printers per school</p>	
30		30	
<p>12" iBook, 1.0 GHz processor, 133MHz FSB, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14-16-24-8x DVDROM/CDRW, 12" TFT screen, 802.11 g/b wireless NIC, No PCMCIA slot, 1.35" x 11.2" x 9.06"; 5.09 lbs, includes carry case/sleeve. Battery life less than 7 hrs, wireless b/g only. Includes original battery & up to 3 replacement batteries (4 total) during lease. Verbal commitment by Apple: Includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop falls.</p>		<p>BAFO Recommended Configuration: Inspiron 700M, Intel Pentium M 725, 12.1" QXGA wide aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB Hard Drive. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW tchr upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext mic not included, OS upgrade not included, Productivity Suite upgrade not incl, silk screen on case not incl. Includes (2) 8-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life), 1,000 spare batteries. Battery replacement for life of lease \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed. New tchr training excludes last yr of program</p>	

<p>14" iBook, DVD-RW Superdrive, 40 GB Ultra ATA 5400RPM Hard Drive, SMART, 24-10-24-8X-2x DVDROM/CDRW, Write to CDR - 24x, Write to CDRW - 10x, Read CDROM - 24x, Read DVDROM - 8x, Write to DVD-R - 2x or Write to DVD+R - 2x, Write to DVD-RW - 2x or Write to DVD+RW - 2x. Incl original battery & up to 3 replacements during lease. Verbal commitment by Apple: Includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop falls. 14" iBook will have 1.42 GHz processor</p>		<p>Original Configuration: Latitude D505, Intel Pentium M 725, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14.1" XGA display. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW tchr upgrade option. No built-in mic. Includes Infocase Classmate case/sleeve. Battery life less than 7 hrs. Includes 2 main bay 6-cell batteries & 1 expansion bay 6-cell w/ each unit (7-10 hrs batt. life). 1 per system per yr as needed. Up to 1.5% whole unit spares, 5% spare parts, Dell managed. BAFO Minimum Configuration: Inspiron 700M, Intel Celeron M 340, 12.1" in QXGA wide-aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW tchr upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext mic not included, OS upgrade not incl, Productivity Suite upgrade not incl, silk screen on case not incl. Includes last yr of program for new tchr training, Dell Exch & Onsite Coaching, DataFlow & Portfolios. Includes (2) 8-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life). Replacement batts for life of lease \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed.</p>	
<p>Recommend various improvements and provide budgetary estimates. Response in BAFO meets requirements.</p>		<p>Strong network assessment proposal. Response meets the requirement. Complete network assessment included in price of all 3 solutions proposed.</p>	
	<p>140</p>		<p>145</p>
	<p>88%</p>		<p>91%</p>
	<p>34.6</p>		<p>36.7</p>
<p>0%</p>		<p>4%</p>	
<p>\$350.00</p>		<p>\$404.25</p>	
<p>\$1,400.00</p>		<p>\$1,524.50</p>	
<p>Price is based upon providing 14" ibook to teachers and 12" ibook to students.</p>		<p>Purchase Price Comparison is based on the Dell recommended configuration (Inspiron 700M Pentium). Additional Pricing provided by Dell: Original Configuration: Latitude D505 \$474.39 per yr (lease), \$1,524.50 (purchase) Dell Minimum Configuration: Inspiron 700M Celeron \$375.08/yr (lease), \$1414.50 (purchase) All include replacement batteries for life of lease</p>	

<p>Platform Shift, Dual network platform support, Testing Instructional existing software for OS X compatibility, Add'l training on new OS platform, Space for Proposed Servers, Adding File Maker-Pro software as substitute for MS Access Battery Charging Stations, Training Plan requires CCSD staff to deliver more of the training than the Dell & IBM proposals, esp. for staff, parent & student training sessions.</p>		<p>TCO - Data collection resources for program instructional evaluation. Collect insurance premiums. Wireless for initial teacher training?</p>	
	<p>174.6</p>		<p>181.7</p>

IBM
Notes
CCSD responsible for creating & testing image 'Core' image will be loaded at factory; customization by local installer
Assel management system does not have online interface at this time
BAFO dated 1/19/05 states that the following staff will be available for the project: Project Management Office Lead Project Manager - (1) Full time Project Administrator - (1) Full time Support Manager - (1) Full time EMTEC Project Manager - (1) Full time Deployment Phase Deployment Manager - (1) Full time Technical Team Lead - (3) Full time Training Team Lead - (1) Full time Trainers - Up to 20 trainers.
Plan Provided
4yr warranty provided On-site support, next business day. Warehouse located in Norcross, but willing to obtain space in Cobb County for this project. See dedicated support staff listed in project management team
Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365. 24x7 toll-free support line for students, teachers, parents, administrators. Requests can be submitted on-line & via phone.
Loaner provided same day if laptop can not be repaired

004414

Replace batteries as part of lease, no limit on numbers. Defective when battery fails to hold a 40% charge.
CCSD requirements met. Intial training to be conducted at local schools.
CCSD requirements met.
Provide all new staff and student training.
5 days of training for 20 tech leads
Linked to national standards only.
Metis Assoc
Provided at \$20 per unit.
Rapid Restore & Access IBM Buton features IBM liason for every school

004415

[Empty response area]

Response meets the requirement. Provides 160 hours of engineer time, CCSD to pay for surveys.

[Empty row]

[Empty row]

[Empty row]

2.93%

\$381.50

\$1,432.04

Purchase price comparison is based on the ThinkPad R51 originally submitted by IBM. Alt configuration (X31/32): \$507.53/yr (lease), \$1,915.04 (purchase)

004416

Surveys / network impact analysis at 37 schools Assel system not web-based.

381.5

004417