

From: Alisa Morningstar
To: Donna Oliver
Date: Thu, Jan 27, 2005 12:34 PM
Subject: Re: Power To Learn

Well I'm glad you got a room - it's no fun being "homeless".

The points must be assigned to reflect the quality of the offerings of the vendors. Can you go ahead and take a look at the attached spreadsheet and rank each major (gray area with the points) category 1-2-3. You can have more than 1 in each category (i.e. you might rank training as 1, 2, 3 or 1,1,2, or 1,2,2). I was hoping to send you what Kim and I worked on yesterday but it is not complete yet and I'd really like to get your rankings to add to the file to make sure that we are recommending the correct vendor before that recommendation is announced. If you can include comments about what offerings presented in the BAFO discussions and documents make the proposal stronger than when reviewed by the Phase 2 committee that would be very helpful. I've also attached a blank template with the subcategories that Kim and I talked about yesterday. We tried to base the subcategories on the priorities that we identified at the start of this phase. Let me know if you think other things should be taken into consideration.

Let me know if you need any other documents to assist you with your rankings.

Thanks,

Alisa Morningstar
Director of Procurement Services
Cobb County School District
6975 Cobb International Blvd.
Kennesaw, GA 30152
Phone: 770-426-3364
Fax: 678-594-8600

The information transmitted is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential, proprietary, and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you received this in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from all computers.

>>> Donna Oliver 1/26/2005 10:36:43 PM >>>
Alisa,

Hello from Orlando! I am finally settled in a hotel room after learning on arrival that the hotel did not have the reservation we made through the conference reservation system. For a while it appeared that I might not have an Internet connection tonight :-)

This looks very complete. Thanks for pulling it together.

I am agreeable to your suggestion for assigning points as long as the point assignment plan results in strong support for our selection of vendor, and it seems it will.

Donna



004378

Donna Oliver, Director
Curriculum & Instruction Division
Cobb County School District
donna.oliver@cobbk12.org
Phone: 770-426-3594
FAX: 770-528-6736
>>> Alisa Morningstar 01/26/05 11:38 AM >>>
Jill,

Yesterday the final evaluation committee for RFP 25-04 met and recommended that we move forward with a February BAI with Apple, the lowest priced finalist, as the recommended vendor for contract negotiation. Procurement will be responsible for providing 3 documents: the BAI, the final negotiations evaluation document and a 1 page summary of the major points from the RFP including how each vendor addressed these points and the price per vendor (info will be taken from the evaluation document). The Budget Department will provide a Total Cost of Ownership analysis based on Apple's annual lease cost.

I am meeting with Kim this afternoon to review the Final Negotiations Evaluation document. We will be assigning points to each vendor and reviewing the document for subjective comments which will be removed. We will review all areas of the document to make sure that proposal changes submitted by all vendors in their 1/19/05 and 1/24/05 BAFO documents are reflected. I will provide this information to you for updating the final evaluation document. Additionally, you need to add information about Apple's server offering (I think we have this summarized nicely in the Phase 2 Apple summary) and Dell's printer offering (from BAFO) to the respective value added sections. Once these changes are made, you will need to email the document to Donna Oliver for her review and input. She is out of town the rest of this week.

Kim, Donna and I will also discuss what items will be included in the 1 page summary and I will get with you about developing.

Susie recommended that we use language similar to the language used in the BAI for RFP 71-01 - WAN regarding pending contract negotiation. Can you locate a copy of this BAI? I believe it was from January or February of 2002.

Donna & Kim:

A couple of weeks ago I recommended that since all three of the vendors participating in the BAFO have already been evaluated as meeting minimum criteria to make it to this phase, we would assign points based on an ordinal ordering in this phase. To facilitate this we would rate each response category for each vendor as a 1, 2, or 3 with (1) being the best, (2) 2nd best and (3) 3rd best. Of course, if you truly feel that 2 responses are equal in a particular area, you would rate them equally. Points will be determined based on these ratings (i.e. a (1) gets all points, a (2) gets partial points, and a (3) gets 1 point). I still recommend that we use this process for documenting the decision.

All,

Please let me know if I've left anything out.

Alisa Morningstar
Director of Procurement Services
Cobb County School District
6975 Cobb International Blvd.
Kennesaw, GA 30152
Phone: 770-426-3364
Fax: 678-594-8600

The information transmitted is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential, proprietary, and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you received this in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from all computers.

| RFP 25-04, Power to Learn | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|----------------|--|----------------|--|----------------|--|--|--|
| Evaluation | | | | | | | | | |
| Vendor: | | APPLE | | | Dell | | IBM | | |
| Area of Evaluation | Points Possible | Points Awarded | Notes | Points Awarded | Notes | Points Awarded | Notes | | |
| INSTALLATION/IMAGING PROJECT | | | | | | | | | |
| 6.2 Imaging, Delivery & Installation Plan | | | | | | | | | |
| | 20 | 0 | BAFO states: "Certified" images applied at factory. Summer refresh each yr. Laptops collected, software updated, laptops stored for summer. Apple states they can meet new deployment timeline. Document distributed 1/11/05 acknowledges that tech leads & wireless infrastructure must be in place. CCSD responsible for creating & testing image. | 0 | Very detailed thorough plan. Recommended and minimum solutions do not provide factory imaging. CCSD responsible for creating and testing image. | 0 | Recommend re-imaging be handled by CCSD Tier 1 tech. Good detailed plan. Image loaded locally. CCSD responsible for creating and testing image. | | |
| Simple Copy of Report for Equipment Installed | | | | | | | | | |
| 6.3 Property Control Plan | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | Satisfactory Online asset management system designed and tested in Maine. | | Subsactory Does not track software changes. | | Satisfactory Asset management system meets requirements but does not have online interface. Response indicates that online interface is under development. | | |
| Asset Tags | | | | | | | | | |
| 6.6 Project Management Plan | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | Satisfactory BAFO states: 1 PM, 1 Tech Lead, 2 Sys. Eng., 2 Prof Dev Consultants, 1 AppleCare Acad Mgr = 7 dedicated Apple personnel. Unrealistic timeline (8 weeks). | | Satisfactory Dedicated project manager, realistic complete timeline. | | Satisfactory "Adopt a School" program provides an IBM Liaison to each Power to Learn school. Detailed, thorough, realistic, confident plan. 1/19/05 response states: Project Management Office Lead Project Manager - (1) Full time Project Administrator - (1) Full time Support Manager - (1) Full time EMTEC Project Manager - (1) Full time Deployment Phase Deployment Manager - (1) Full time Technical Team Lead - (3) Full time Training Team Lead - (1) Full time Trainers - Up to 20 trainers | | |
| WARRANTY & SUPPORT | | | | | | | | | |
| 6.4 Warranty and Support - on-site support or depot pickup | | | | | | | | | |
| | 40 | 0 | Daily pick-up and delivery to all schools. Dedicated local repair facility to provide overnight repair service. Depot pickup. | 0 | On-site support next business day for hardware only. Software issues, including reimaging, responsibility of CCSD. No reimaging staffs proposed. | 0 | On-site support, next business day. Warehouse located in Harrois, but willing to obtain space in Cobb County for this project. | | |

| | | | | |
|---|--|--|---|--|
| How quickly we can expect to get a loaner laptop | | 1/18/05 response states: Apple will repair computer overnight or provide a spare so as to return every user to service within one school day. | Loaner provided same day laptop cannot be repaired. | Provides loaner same day laptop can not be repaired - if hardware problem cannot be resolved with 1 phone call. |
| Broken Screen/repairs addressed in proposal | | Screens/Accidental Damage covered under insurance plan Not covered in any warranty option. | Addressed with extended warranty coverage | Recommend coverage to be included in self-insurance. |
| Spare Parts on-site or off-site | | BAFO states: At least 5% customer installable parts at each school. 1.5% spare laptops at each school. Barry Wright stated 1/11/05 that Apple has identified a local facility. Previous notes: - Spare units housed at Apple repair facility (location TBD). - Batteries, AC adapters and keyboards are the only parts that will be stocked at schools; other parts will be at the repair facility (location TBD). | DS05 solution provides up to 1.5% whole unit spares, 5% spare parts, Dell managed. Other 2 Dell solutions offer 2 whole unit spares per school and variable CRU spares as needed. | BAFO proposes spare parts be maintained at depot. CCSD requires that customer installable parts be located at each school. 1/18/05 response states: Will consider deploying to schools if determine more convenient as work through the project. |
| help desk - onsite support/ phone support/on-line support | | 24x7 toll-free support line for students, teachers, parents, administrators. No on-site/on-line capability listed. Telephone only. Tier II HelpDesk support for Tech Leads. Patching Malware at each school. Sufficient # stations at each school? | Submitted on-line & via phone. 24/7 Help Desk support. | Work orders submitted on-line & via phone. BAFO recommends CCSD provide on-site Tier I tech from 7a-4p M-F. IBM to provide Help Desk coverage from 4-9 M-F and 9-9 on Saturday. 1/24/05 response provides 24x7x365 help desk coverage. |
| help desk - Dedicated to CCSD. | | Unique Help Desk number for CCSD 24x7x365. | Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365. | Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365. |
| warranty coverage -batteries provided for life of lease | | Coverage for the life of the lease. Original battery w/ system & up to 3 replacement batteries (4 total) for each system. 1/24/05 response indicates a willingness to be flexible regarding the installation of batteries over the 4 yr period. | One battery per year for life of lease. | Replace batteries as part of lease, no limit on numbers. |
| warranty coverage -when a battery is considered defective | | Apple defines a battery as defective if it can not hold power for at least 60 minutes, is less than 1 yr old & has had less than 500 charging cycles. May require CCSD to purchase batteries if more than 300 charging cycles per battery per yr are required. With 180 school days a year and a battery life of up to 6 yrs, this may require 2 charges a day to meet the 7 hr uptime requirement of the RFP. | Defective when battery will not hold 100% charge. | Defective when battery fails to hold a 40% charge. |

004382

| TRAINING | 40 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
|--|----|---|--|--|---|
| Initial staff training | | | Recommend initial teacher training at high schools. CCSD prefers home school. Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver. Initial staff training not differentiated. Overall training plan should have a more data driven focus. Planning/managing tech rich classroom not addressed until Phase II. Plan to incorporate out-of-box training into new hire process. | At local schools, no CCSD personnel required for training, differentiated instruction. For Dell Minimum Solution - not acceptable to eliminate Dell Exchange in last year. | Initial and ongoing assessment of teachers and students. Differentiated training, no CCSD personnel required for training, offered at local schools. |
| Initial Student/Parent Training | | | Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver training. Addl vendor trainers needed to support at schools w/ large enrollments. Limited to 112 days to support initial rollout and 40 to support new staff and students (10 days per semester) | Excellent tutorial system, after hours training at each school, 1 CCSD par session to support, ESL support, good ratio of students to trainer. | 2 hours face-to-face for each student/parent. At local schools, after hours and weekends, no CCSD personnel required, ESL provisions provided, strong trainer/student ratio. Includes license for student email (ePALS) for 56,000 students for 3 yrs. Includes license for SAS in schools for 3 yrs. |
| Annual New Staff and Student Training | | | Apple provides no training to new staff/students. Plan to be developed w/ CCSD utilizing Train the Trainer model. | Provide training to 700 additional teachers/year | Provide all new staff and student training. |
| Technology Support Staff Training | | | 5 days of training for 3 groups of 17, additional training will be provided on an as needed basis | Training for District or local school staff at no additional cost, tutorial available online. | Think Vantage tools - 5 days of training for 20 tech leads, plan depends heavily on IBM providing school support. |
| Ongoing Curriculum Technology Integration Training | | | Delivery plan for ongoing training for train the trainers is not clear - Learning Development Center's purpose unclear | Strong link to CCSD standards, a detailed three year plan, train the trainer. | Linked to national standards only, train the trainer model offered to adequate if trainers, excellent leadership courses. Plan not adequate in providing best practices and emerging technology courses for teachers. Quarterly training reports provided. |

004383

| | | | | | | | |
|--|------------|----------|--|----------|---|----------|---|
| <p>PROGRAM INSTRUCTIONAL EVAL 3.8 Program Instructional Evaluation</p> | <p>-10</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Proposes partnership w/local Learning & Performance Support Lab at UGA. Similar project partnerships not clearly defined & not as large in scope as P2L. Evaluation components limited in scope focusing on achievement in writing, rather than increasing achievement across curriculum. Evaluation plan general in nature & did not include specific data collections. Proposal provides for a 20% sampling of CCSD population, add'l cost for full population Evaluation plan is independent of training plan and community communication plan. Evaluation concludes at the end of yr3 (need a min of 3 full yrs use by HS students & 2 full yrs use by MS).</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Clearly indicates research groups have completed similar projects of scope/size for multiple organizations. Proposed projects clearly demonstrate understanding of importance for providing immediate & long-term info to the public & CCSD. Well-defined 3 phased timeline to begin before deployment to teachers or students. # research/eval components tied to Dell's communication plan. Phase 1, 2, & 3 include the following annual activities: questionnaires, surveys, student test data, quantitative & qualitative data analysis, semi-annual & annual draft conclusions/recommendations. Longitudinal analysis following cohorts of HS & MS students across 2 yrs: achievement gains, attitudes, skills, behaviors, & post-secondary education (as relevant). Teachers/administrators - changes in professional routines & productivity, school-home communication. Large scale quantitative analysis of questions determined important by CCSD. Pre & posttest data available each yr. Student achievement data from CCSD will be compared to comparable Districts in GA. Offered a 3rd research opportunity - HS Pilot, Digital Portfolio - 4 schools. Design/implementation digital portfolio system that aligns to CCSD standards & supports District's graduate profile. Training/support provided by Ideas Consulting. Will provide a school coach for 4-6 teachers & 100 students per school for project duration 6-8 months.</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Meets Assoc references provided w/pre-qualification support that Metis has experience w/ similar projects of scope/size. Proposal well grounded in standard, acceptable evaluation practices. Evaluations will be formative (process) & summative (outcomes) using multiple measures over multiple groups to include students, teachers, administrators, parents, & other key stakeholders. Data sources will be qualitative & quantitative. Formative evaluation data will be project documentation, field observations, focus groups, individual interviews, and written surveys. Metis will use a comparison school design in which CCSD schools' state assessment results are compared to schools outside of CCSD. All findings will be shared w/ key CCSD staff during quarterly assessment/review meetings, giving CCSD opportunity to adjust to meet project goals. Summative evaluation data sources include state data sources & other sources. Metis will meet w/ CCSD to final develop the research evaluation questions to be answered during research period. Data sources will also be defined at that time. Proposal includes the 3-yr plan as well as data collection points & reports. Metis is also proposing a more in-depth case study approach be considered for yr 2 & 3. Final evaluation reports will be provided to the public at end of contact time - yr 3.</p> |
| <p>ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS 3.5 Insurance</p> | <p>20</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>BAFO states: Covers Accidental Damage, Theft, Power surge/lightning, vandalism, water damage, natural disasters. \$100 deductible, \$49 premium. Names Software as insurer. Previous notes: Does not meet 3 requirements: No guarantee of premium limit to \$50. All risk - excludes damages from environmental causes i.e. heat, cold, dampness, dryness. Required CCSD to collect of premiums.</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Meets requirements except for whether CSI handles collection of premiums. \$40 premium/\$100 deductible.</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>BAFO recommends self-insurance. Original proposal meets and exceeds requirements: \$40 premium/\$100 deductible. Collects premiums. Accepts installment payments from students qualifying for free & reduced. All risk excludes broken screens. Local claims processing, local repairs.</p> |
| <p>3.9 Disposal Plan</p> | | | <p>Provided at \$12 per unit.</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Provided - 1/24/05 response states \$2.65 for lease options, \$10 for purchase options.</p> | <p>0</p> | <p>Provided at \$20 per unit.</p> |

004384

| | | | | |
|--|----|--|---|---|
| 5.10 Safety and Security System | | Meets requirement with Apple Remote Desktop 2 application. | Does not meet requirement. Not critical to success of program. | Meets requirement for additional cost. Not critical to success of program. |
| 5.11 Value Added Options | | Life Safe, Communication Plan Mac OS X server solutions: PI - add 7 servers to District to support teacher iBook G4 computers PII - Add 16 replica servers & add 42 storage servers managing 23 RAID Units to CCSD network for HS student | Comprehensive Communication Plan, (5) 1700N 84W networked laser printers and (1) 3000CN color networked laser printers per school | Communication Plan Hardware Durability Rapid Restore Access IBM Button |
| 5.14 ISP Options for Home Use | | Basic Dial up rates | Basic Dial up rates | Basic Dial up rates |
| TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS | | | | |
| 5.12 Technical Specifications | 30 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Technical Specifications - add'l configuration | | 12" iBook, 1.0 GHz processor, 133MHz FSB, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14-16-24-8x DVDROM/CDRW, 12" TFT screen, 802.11 g/b wireless NIC, No PCMCIA slot, 1.35" x 11.2" x 8.06", 5.09 lbs, includes carry case/leaves. Battery life less than 7 hrs. wireless big only. Includes original battery & up to 3 replacement batteries (4 total) during lease. <i>Verbal commitment by Apple: Includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop fails.</i> | Latitude D605, Intel Pentium M 725, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14.1" XGA display, DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW ltr upgrade option. No built-in mic. Includes Infocase Classroom case/leave. Battery life less than 7 hrs. Includes 2 main bay 6-cell batteries & 1 expansion bay 6-cell w/ each unit (7-10 hrs batt. life). 1 per system per yr as needed. Up to 1.5% whole unit spares, 5% spare parts, Dell managed. | ThinkPad R51, Intel Celeron M 1.5 Mhz, 512 L2 Cache, 400 MHz FSB, 512 MB PC 2700 SDRAM configured w/ (2) 256 MB memory sticks. To be upgraded to (1) 512 MB memory stick when cost of memory is at parity. Upgradable to 2 GB. 40 GB HDD, 5400 RPM, 24-x24-24-8x DVDROM/CDROM, 14" TFT screen, 602.11 a/b/g, PCMCIA port, 1.5x12.25x11, 6 lb, 6 oz, Battery life less than 7 hrs., Body Glove case Includes unlimited replacement batteries for life of the lease. |
| | | 14" iBook, DVD-RW Superdrive, 40 GB Ultra ATA 5400RPM Hard Drive, SMART, 24-10-24-8x-2x DVDROM/CDRW, Write to CDR - 24x, Write to CDRW 16x, Read CDRW - 24x, Read DVDROM - 8x, Write to DVD-R - 2x or Write to DVD+R - 2x, Write to DVD-RW - 2x or Write to DVD+RW - 2x. Incl original battery & up to 3 replacements during lease. <i>Verbal commitment by Apple: Includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop fails. 14" iBook will have 1.42 GHz processor.</i> | Inspiron 700M, Intel Pentium M 725, 12.1" QXGA wide aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB Hard Drive, DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW ltr upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext mic not included, OS upgrade not included, Productivity Suite upgrade not incl, silk screen on case not incl. Includes (2) 6-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life), 1,000 spare batteries. Battery replacement for life of lease \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed. New ltr training excludes last yr of program. | X31 series (to be transitioned to the X32 in March '05) is 3.6 lb, 12" TFT, Pentium M, external USB CDRW/DVD, 6 cell battery w/ 5.5 hours life. |

004385

| | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|--|
| <p>Technical Specifications - add'l configuration</p> | | | <p>Inspiron 700M, Intel Celeron M 340, 12.1" in WXGA wide-aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW tch upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext. mic not included, OS upgrade not incl, Productivity Suite upgrade not incl, silk screen on case not incl. Includes last yr of program for new tchr training, Dell Exch & Onsite Coaching DataFlow & Portfolios, includes (2) 6-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life). Replacement bats for life of lease \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed.</p> | |
| <p>Physical evaluation of equipment</p> | | | <p>Models proposed with Dell Recommended as Minimum. Solutions would need to be evaluated if considered.</p> | <p>Bulky external battery.</p> |
| <p>Equipment Performance evaluation</p> | | | <p>Models proposed with Dell Recommended as Minimum. Solutions would need to be evaluated if considered.</p> | |
| <p>5.13 Network Impact Analysis</p> | | <p>Recommend various improvements and provide budgetary estimates. Response in BAFO meets requirements.</p> | <p>Strong network assessment proposal. Response meets the requirement. Complete network assessment included in price of all 3 solutions proposed.</p> | <p>Response meets the requirement. Provides 160 hours of engineer time, CCSO to pay for surveys.</p> |
| <p>Software</p> | | <p>! Mac version of MS Office does not include FrontPage, Access and Publisher. Consider requesting a block of licenses for equivalent applications (and online training) to meet updated requirements of HS business curriculum. Curriculum software offered @ 25.29 per seat (1.6 mil) ! Request more robust graphing calculator. ! Request Apex class tools for all courses available and upcoming. ! APEX Beyond Books and NoteTaker do not meet an instructional need. ! Content currently offered through Wikitwice is free on the Web and textbook content is limited at this time (indexing of content is of some value)</p> | <p>Strong data driven plan.</p> | <p>3 years of ePALS included 3 years of SAS in School included</p> |

| | | | | | | |
|---|-----|----|--|----|--|--|
| Subtotal | 160 | 0 | | 0 | | 0 |
| | | 0% | | 0% | | 0% |
| PRICE | 40 | 0 | | 0 | | 0 |
| Implicit Interest Rate 4 yr lease | | | 0% | | 4% | 2.93% |
| Lease/Purchase Cost for Total Solution 4-Yr | | | \$350.00 | | D505 \$474.38 per yr 700M Pentium (Dell Rec.) \$404.25/yr 700M Celeron (Dell min.) \$375.08/yr (Rec. & Min. figures shown include replacement batteries for life of lease.) | ThinkPad R51: \$381.50 per yr All configuration (X31/X2): \$507.53/yr (Note: Above includes OS upgrade option & 7x24x365 help desk.) |
| Purchase price | | | \$1,400.00 | | 700M Pentium (Dell Rec.) \$1,524.50 700M Celeron (Dell min.) \$1,414.50 (Figures include replacement batteries for 4 yrs.) | ThinkPad R51: \$1,432.04 X31: \$1,915.04 |
| Total Cost of Ownership | | | Platform Shell, Dual network platform support, Teaching Instructional training software for OS X compatibility, Add'l training on new OS platform, Space for Proposed Services, Ability File Maker-Pro software as substitute for MS Access, Battery Charging Stations, Training Plan requires CCSD staff to deliver more of the training than the Dell & IBM proposals, esp. for staff, parent & student training sessions. | | TCO - Data collection resources for program instructional evaluation. Collect insurance premiums. Wireless for initial teacher training? | Surveys / network impact analysis of 37 schools Local system not web-based |
| Comments rePartnership | | | Strong commitment to partnership communicated in vendor meeting and BAFO. | | Final vendor meeting and BAFO fails to demonstrate a commitment to the level of flexibility required to achieve goals. | SMA representatives and written communications demonstrate a strong willingness to meet CCSD needs. Expresses flexibility and commitment to partnership. However, the BAFO suggests there could be changes as contract is transitioned to Levocon. |
| Total Points | 200 | 0 | | 0 | | 0 |

004387