

**From:** Jill Vestal  
**To:** Alisa Morningstar; Donald Beers; Donna Oliver; Joseph Redden;  
kimquinn@doe.k12.ga.us; sdoty@bcwr.com  
**Date:** Tue, Jan 25, 2005 1:43 PM  
**Subject:** RFP 25-04 Power To Learn

Attached, please find a revised evaluation spreadsheet for RFP 25-04. Alisa will bring hardcopies to today's meeting.

Thank you,  
Jill Vestal

STATE'S  
EXHIBIT

78

004319

RFP 25-04, Power to Learn							
Evaluation							
Vendor:		APPLE		Dell		IBM	
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes
<b>INSTALLATION/IMAGING/PROJECT MGMT/PROPERTY CONTROL</b>							
5.2 Imaging, Delivery & Installation Plan	20	0	BAFO states: "Certified" images applied at factory. Summer refresh each yr. Laptops collected, software updated, laptops stored for summer. Apple states they can meet new deployment timeline. Document distributed 1/11/06 acknowledges that tech leads & wireless infrastructures must be in place. CCSD responsible for creating & testing image.	0	Very detailed thorough plan. Recommended and minimum solutions do not provide factory imaging. CCSD responsible for creating and testing image.	0	Recommend re-imaging be handled by CCSD Tier 1 tech. Good detailed plan. Image loaded locally. CCSD responsible for creating and testing image.
Sample Copy of Report for Equipment Installed			Satisfactory		Satisfactory		Satisfactory
5.3 Property Control Plan			Online asset management system designed and tested in Maine.		Does not track software changes.		Asset management system meets requirements but does not have online interface. Response indicates that online interface is under development.
Asset Tags			Satisfactory		Satisfactory		Satisfactory
5.6 Project Management Plan			BAFO states: 1 PM, 1 Tech Lead, 2 Sys. Eng., 2 Prof Dev Consultants, 1 AppleCare Acct Mgr = 7 dedicated Apple personnel. Unrealistic timeline (8 weeks).		Dedicated project manager, realistic complete timeline.		"Adopt a School" program provides an IBM Liaison to each Power to Learn school. Detailed, thorough, realistic, confident plan. 3/18/05 response states: Project Management Office Lead Project Manager - (1) Full time Project Administrator - (1) Full time Support Manager - (1) Full time EMTEC Project Manager - (1) Full time  Deployment Phase Deployment Manager - (3) Full time Technical Team Lead - (3) Full time Training Team Lead - (1) Full time Trainers - Up to 20 trainers
<b>WARRANTY &amp; SUPPORT</b>							
5.4 Warranty and Support - on-site support or depot pickup	40	0	Daily pick-up and delivery to all schools. Dedicated local repair facility to provide overnight repair service. Depot pickup.	0	On-site support next business day for hardware only. Software issues, including reimaging, responsibility of CCSD. No reimaging stations proposed.	0	On-site support, next business day. Warehouse (located) in Norcross, but willing to obtain space in Cobb County for this project.

How quickly we can expect to get a loaner laptop		1/15/05 response states: Apple will repair computer overnight or provide a spare so as to return every user to service within two school day.	owner provided same day laptop cannot be repaired.	Provide loaner same day laptop can not be repaired - if hardware problems cannot be resolved with 1 phone call.
Broken Screen/repairs addressed in proposal		Screen/Accidental Damage covered under insurance plan. Not covered in any warranty option.	Addressed with extended warranty coverage	Recommend coverage to be included in self-insurance.
Spare Parts on-site or off-site		BAFO states: At least 6% customer installable parts at each school. 1.5% spare laptops at each school. Barry Wright stated 1/15/05 that Apple has identified a local facility. Previous roles: - Spare units housed at Apple repair facility (location TBD). - Batteries, AC adapters and keyboards are the only parts that will be stocked at schools; other parts will be at the repair facility (location TBD).	CCSD solution provides up to 1.5% whole unit spares, 5% spare parts. Dell managed. Other 2 Dell solutions offer 2 whole unit spares per school and variable CRU spares as needed.	BAFO proposes spare parts be maintained at depot. CCSD requires that customer replaceable parts be located at each school. 1/15/05 response states: Will consider deploying to schools if determine more convenient as work through the project.
help desk - onsite support/ phone support/on-line support		24/7 toll-free support line for students, teachers, parents, administration. No co-incident-line capability listed. Telephone only. Tier II HelpDesk support for Tech Leads. Re-imagining stations at each school. Sufficient # stations at each school?	Submitted on-line & via phone. 7x24 Help Desk support.	Work orders submitted on-line & via phone. BAFO recommends CCSD provide on-site Tier I tech from 7a-4p M-F. IBM to provide Help Desk coverage from 4-8 M-F and 8-8 on Saturday. 12/4/05 response provides 24x7x365 help desk coverage.
help desk - Dedicated to CCSD.		Unique Help Desk number for CCSD 24x7x365.	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365.	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk 24x7x365.
warranty coverage -batteries provided for life of lease		Coverage for the life of the lease. Original battery of system & up to 3 replacement batteries (if total) for each system. 12/4/05 response indicates a willingness to be flexible regarding the installation of batteries over the 4 yr period.	One battery per year for life of lease.	Replaces batteries as part of lease, no limit on numbers.
warranty coverage -when a battery is considered defective		Apple defines a battery as defective if it can not hold power for at least 60 minutes, is less than 1 yr old & has had less than 300 charging cycles. May require CCSD to purchase batteries if more than 300 charging cycles per battery per yr are required. With 180 school days a year and a battery life of up to 5 yrs, the may require 2 changes a day to meet the 7 yr system requirement of the RFP.	Defective when battery will not hold 100% charge.	Defective when battery fails to hold a 40% charge.

TRAINING	40	0	0	0	0
Initial Staff Training			Recommend initial teacher training at high schools. CCSD prefers home school. Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver. Initial staff training not differentiated. Overall training plan should have a more data driven focus. Planning/Managing tech rich classroom not addressed until Phase II. Plan to incorporate out-of-box training into new hire process.	At local schools, no CCSD personnel required for training, differentiated instruction. For Dell Minimum Solution - not acceptable to eliminate Dell Exchange in last year.	Initial and ongoing assessment of teachers and students. Differentiated training, no CCSD personnel required for training, offered at local schools.
Initial Student/Parent Training			Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver training. Add'l vendor trainers needed to support at schools w/ large enrollments. Limited to 112 days to support initial rollout and 40 to support new staff and students (10 days per semester.)	Excellent tutorial system, after hours training at each school, 1 CCSD per session to support, ESL support, good ratio of students to trainer.	2 hours face-to-face for each student/parent. At local schools, after hours and weekends, no CCSD personnel required, ESL provisions provided, strong trainer/student ratio. Includes license for student email (ePALE) for 56,000 students for 3 yrs. Includes license for SAS in schools for 3 yrs.
Annual New Staff and Student Training			Apple provides no training to new staff/students. Plan to be developed w/ CCSD utilizing Train the Trainer model.	Provide training to 700 additional teachers/year	Provide all new staff and student training.
Technology Support Staff Training			3 days of training for 3 groups of 17, additional training will be provided on an as needed basis	Training for District or local school staff at no additional cost, tutorial available online.	Think Vantage tools - 5 days of training for 20 tech leads, plan depends heavily on IBA providing school support.
Ongoing Curriculum Technology Integration Training			Delivery plan for ongoing training for train the trainers is not clear - Learning Development Center's purpose unclear	Strong link to CCSD standards, a detailed three year plan, train the trainer.	Linked to national standards only, train the trainer model offered to adequate # trainers, excellent leadership courses. Plan not adequate in providing best practices and emerging technology courses for teachers. Quarterly training reports provided.

PROGRAM/INSTRUCTIONAL EVAL.	10	0	0	0	0
<p>6.8 Program Instructional Evaluation</p>			<p>Proposes partnership w/ local Learning &amp; Performance Support Lab at UGA. Similar project partnerships not clearly defined &amp; not as large in scope as P2L. Evaluation components limited in scope focusing on achievement in writing, rather than increasing achievement across curriculum. Evaluation plan general in nature &amp; did not include specific data collections. Proposal provides for a 20% sampling of CCSD population, and cost for full population. Evaluation plan is independent of training plan and community communication plan. Evaluation concludes at the end of yr 3 (need a min of 3 full yrs use by HS students &amp; 2 full yrs use by MS).</p>	<p>Clearly indicates research groups have completed similar projects of acceptable for multiple organizations. Proposed projects clearly demonstrate understanding of importance for providing immediate &amp; long-term info to the public &amp; CCSD. Well-defined 3 phased timeline to begin before deployment to teachers or students. All research/eval components tied to Dell's communication plan. Phase 1, 2, &amp; 3 include the following annual activities: questionnaires, surveys, student test data, quantitative &amp; qualitative data analysis, semi-annual &amp; annual draft conclusions/recommendations. Longitudinal analysis following cohorts of HS &amp; MS students across 2 yrs: achievement gains, attitudes, skills, behaviors, &amp; post-secondary education (as relevant). Teachers/administrators - changes in professional routines &amp; productivity, school-home communication. Large scale quantitative analysis of questions determined important by CCSD. Pre &amp; posttest data available each yr. Student achievement data from CCSD will be compared to comparable Districts in GA. Offered a 3rd research opportunity - HS Pilot Digital Portfolio - 4 schools. Design/implement digital portfolio system that aligns to CCSD standards &amp; supports District's graduate profile. Training/support provided by Ideas Consulting. UGA provide a school coach for 4-6 teachers &amp; 100 students per school for project duration 6-8 months.</p>	<p>Metis Assoc references provided w/ pre-qualification support that Metis has experience w/ similar projects of acceptable. Proposal well grounded in standard, acceptable evaluation practices. Evaluations will be formative (process) &amp; summative (outcomes) using multiple measures over multiple groups to include students, teachers, administrators, parents, &amp; other key stakeholders. Data sources will be qualitative &amp; quantitative. Formative evaluation data will be project documentation, field observations, focus groups, individual interviews, and written surveys. Metis will use a comparison school design in which CCSD schools' state assessment results are compared to schools outside of CCSD. All findings will be shared w/ key CCSD staff during quarterly assessment/review meetings, giving CCSD opportunity to adjust to meet project goals. Summative evaluation data sources include state data sources &amp; other sources. Metis will meet w/ CCSD to final develop the research evaluation questions to be answered during research period. Data sources will also be defined at that time. Proposal includes the 3-yr plan as well as data collection points &amp; reports. Metis is also proposing a more in-depth case study approach be considered for yr 2 &amp; 3. Final evaluation reports will be provided to the public at end of contract term - yr 3.</p>
<p>ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS:</p>	20	0	0	0	0
<p>6.5 Insurance</p>			<p>BAFO states: Covers Accidental Damage, Theft, Power surge/lightning, vandalism, water damage, natural disasters. \$100 deductible, \$49 premium. Names Safewise as insurer. Previous notes: Does not meet 3 requirements: No guarantee of premium limit to \$50. All risk - excludes damages from environmental causes i.e. heat, cold, dampness, dryness. Required CCSD to collect of premiums.</p>	<p>Meets requirements except for whether CSI handles collection of premiums. \$40 premium/\$100 deductible.</p>	<p>BAFO recommends self-insurance. Original proposal meets and exceeds requirements: \$40 premium/\$100 deductible. Collects premiums. Accepts installment payments from students qualifying for free &amp; reduced. All risk includes broken screens. Local claims processing, local repairs.</p>
<p>6.9 Disposal Plan</p>			<p>Provided at \$12 per unit.</p>	<p>Provided - 1/24/05 response states \$2.65 for lease options, \$10 for purchase options.</p>	<p>Provided at \$20 per unit.</p>

3.10 Safety and Security System		Meets requirement with Apple Remote Desktop 2 application.	Does not meet requirement. Not critical to success of program.	Meets requirement for additional cost. Not critical to success of program.
3.11 Value Added Options		Life Suite, Communication Plan	Comprehensive plan indicates willingness to partner with CSCD for successful project.	Communication Plan Hardware Durability Rapid Restore Access (Dial) Button
3.14 ISP Options for Home Use		Basic Dial up rates	Basic Dial up rates	Basic Dial up rates
<b>TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS</b>				
3.12 Technical Specifications		12" iBook, 1.0 GHz processor, 133MHz FSB, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14-16-24-2x DVD/ROM/CDRW, 12" TFT screen, 802.11 gb wireless NIC, No PCMCIA slot, 1.35" x 11.2" x 9.08"; 5.09 lbs, includes carry case/sleeve. Battery life less than 7 hrs, wireless b/g only. Includes original battery & up to 3 replacement batteries (4 total) during lease. <i>Verbal commitment by Apple: includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop falls.</i>	Latitude D505, Intel Pentium M 725, 512 MB RAM, 40 GB HD, 14.1" XGA display, DVD/CDRW included, DVD/ROM/CDRW upgrade option. No built-in mic. Includes Infocase Classroom case/sleeve. Battery life less than 7 hrs. Includes 2 main bay 6-cell batteries & 1 expansion bay 6-cell w/ each unit (7-10 hrs batt. life). 1 per system per yr as needed. Up to 1.5% whole unit spares, 5% spare parts, Dell managed.	ThinkPad R51, Intel Celeron M 1.5 Mhz, 512 L2 Cache, 400 MHz FSB, 512 MB PC 2700 SDRAM configured w/ (2) 256 MB memory sticks. To be upgraded to (1) 512 MB memory stick when cost of memory is at parity. Upgradable to 2 GB. 40 GB HDD, 5400 RPM, 24-x24-24-2x DVD/ROM/CDRW, 14" TFT screen, 802.11 a/b/g, PCMCIA port, 1.5x12.25x11, 6 lb, Battery life less than 7 hrs., Body Glove case  Includes unlimited replacement batteries for life of the lease.
Technical Specifications - add'l configuration		14" iBook, DVD-RW Superdrive, 40 GB Ultra ATA 5400RPM Hard Drive, SMART, 24-10-24-8x-2x DVD/ROM/CDRW, Write to CDR - 2x, Write to CDRW - 1x, Read CDRW - 2x, Read DVD/ROM - 2x, Write to DVD-R - 2x or Write to DVD+R - 2x, Write to DVD-RW - 2x or Write to DVD+RW - 2x. Incl original battery & up to 3 replacements during lease. <i>Verbal commitment by Apple: includes "mobile motion module" that freezes hard drive if laptop falls. 14" iBook will have 1.4 GHz processor.</i>	Inspiron 2004, Intel Pentium M 725, 12.1" WXGA wide aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB Hard Drive. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/ROM/CDRW upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext mic not included, OS upgrade not included, Productivity Suite upgrade not incl, silk screen on case not incl. Includes (2) 8-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life), 1,000 spare batteries. Battery replacement for life of lease. \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed. New lch training excludes last yr of program.	X32 series (to be transitioned to the X32 in March '05) is 3.6 lbs, 12" TFT, Pentium M, external USB CDRW/DVD, 6 cell battery w/ 5.5 hours life.

004324

<p>Technical Specifications - add'l configuration</p>			<p>Inspiron 7000, Intel Celeron M 340, 12.1" w WXGA wide-aspect display, 512 MB, 40 GB. DVD/CDRW included, DVD/RW tch upgrade option. Includes Body Glove Neoprene Sleeve. Ext mic not included, OS upgrade not incl. Productivity Suite upgrade not incl. screen on case not incl. Includes 1st yr of program for new tch training, Dell Tech &amp; Onsite Coaching DataFlow &amp; Portfolios. Includes (2) 8-cell batteries (8-10 hrs batt. life). Replacement bats for life of lease \$75.50 per system. 2 whole unit spares/school, variable CRU spares as needed.</p>	
<p>Physical evaluation of equipment</p>			<p>Models proposed with Dell Recommended an Minimum Solutions would need to be evaluated if considered.</p>	<p>Bulky external battery.</p>
<p>Equipment Performance evaluation</p>			<p>Models proposed with Dell Recommended an Minimum Solutions would need to be evaluated if considered.</p>	
<p>5.13 Network Impact Analysis</p>		<p>Recommend various improvements and provide budgetary estimates. Response in BAFO meets requirements.</p>	<p>Strong network assessment proposal. Response meets the requirement. Complete network assessment included in price of all 3 solutions proposed.</p>	<p>Response meets the requirement. Provides 160 hours of engineer time, CCSD to pay for surveys.</p>
<p>Software</p>		<p>1. Misc version of MS Office does not include FrontPage, Access and Publisher. Consider requesting a block of licenses for equivalent applications (and online training) to meet updated requirements of HS business curriculum.                  2. Curriculum software offered @ 25.29 per seat (1.6 st)                  3. Request more robust graphing calculator.                  4. Request Apex class teds for all courses available and upcoming.                  5. APEX Beyond Books and NoteTaker do not meet an instructional need.                  6. Content currently offered through Wikisource is free on the Web and indicates content is limited at this time (including of content is of some value)</p>	<p>Strong data driven plan.</p>	<p>3 years of ePALS included                  3 years of SAS in School included</p>

Subtotal	160	0		0		0
		0%		0%		0%
PRICE	40	0		0		0
Implicit Interest Rate 4 yr lease			0%		4%	2.83%
Lease/Purchase Cost for Total Solution 4-Yr			\$350.00		D505 \$474.39 per yr 700M Pentium (Dell Rec.) \$404.25/yr 700M Celeron (Dell min.) \$375.08/yr (Rec. & Min. figures shown include replacement batteries for life of lease.)	ThinkPad R51: \$365.84 per yr All configuration (X31/X32): \$491.87/yr (Note: Add \$15.66 to each of the above to include OS upgrade. Above pricing includes 7x24x365 help desk.)
Purchase price			\$1,400.00		700M Pentium (Dell Rec.) \$1,524.50 700M Celeron (Dell min.) \$1,414.50 (Figures include replacement batteries for 4 yrs.)	ThinkPad R51: \$1,372.04 X31: \$1,855.04
Total Cost of Ownership					FCO - Data collection resources for program instructional evaluation. Collect insurance premiums. Wireless for initial teacher training?	Surveys / research impact analysis at 30 schools Asset system not web-based.
Comments re Partnership			Strong commitment to partnership communicated in vendor meeting and BAFO.		Final vendor meeting and BAFO topic to demonstrate a commitment to the level of flexibility required to achieve goals.	BAFO representatives and written communications demonstrate a strong willingness to meet CCSD needs. Expresses flexibility and commitment to partnership. However, the BAFO suggests there could be changes as contract is transferred to Lovett.
Total Points	200	0		0		0

004326