

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Phase 2 Evaluation

Vendor:	Dell	IBM	Apple Computer	HP					
Current Overall Rank:	1	2	3	4					
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes				
Installation/Integration/Configuration/Reporting/Control	8	8	Very detailed thorough plan	7	Good detailed plan. Image loaded locally.	4	Installation plan worries, no presence in Atlanta area	4	No image development/testing assistance.
6.2 Imaging, Delivery & Installation Plan	8	8	Very detailed thorough plan	7	Good detailed plan. Image loaded locally.	4	Installation plan worries, no presence in Atlanta area	4	No image development/testing assistance.
Sample Copy of Report for Equipment Installed	1	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory
Property Control Plan	2	1	Does not track software changes	2	Satisfactory	2	Satisfactory	1	Very minimal sample provided
Asset Tags	1	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory	1	Satisfactory
6.6 Project Management Plan	8	8	Dedicated project manager, realistic complete timeline	8	Detailed, thorough, realistic. Confident plan.	5	Un-realistic timeline (6 weeks)	6	Limited details submitted
WARRANTY SUPPORT	10	10		10		6		7	
Subsections:									
6.4 Warranty and Support - on-site support or depot pickup	10	10	Provided On-site support next business day	10	Provided On-site support next business day	7	Depot pickup, almost insures a best of 48 hrs for repairs	8	Provides on-site support. On-site model could be clearer
How quickly we can expect to get a loaner laptop	5	5	Provided loaner same day laptop can not be repaired	5	Provided loaner same day laptop can not be repaired	3	Loaner provided if not repair in 48 hours	2	Will provide loaners. Note clear when provided
Broken Screen repairs addressed in proposal	2	2	Addressed with extended warranty coverage	2	ThinkPad Protection solution covers accidents as part of \$	0	Not addressed in proposal	1	Broken Screen All Risk solution provided with 1 screen per yr
Spare Parts on-site or off-site	3	3	Spare parts on-site	3	Spare parts on-site	1	Spare parts stored off-site	3	Spare parts on-site
Help desk - on-site support/ phone support/on-line support	3	2	Work orders can be submitted on-line & via phone	2	Work orders can be submitted on-line & via phone	1	No on-site/on-line capability listed. Telephone only.	1	No on-site/on-line capability listed. Telephone only.
p desk - Dedicated to CCSD	2	2	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk	2	Dedicated CCSD Help Desk	2	Unique Help Desk Number for CCSD	0	Regular help desk
warranty coverage - batteries provided for life of lease	10	9	Provide one battery per year for life of lease	10	Replaces batteries as part of lease, no limit on numbers	9	Provides one battery per year	4	Includes 1 extra 8 cell battery with some spares available (?)
warranty coverage - when a battery is considered defective	5	5	Defective when battery will not hold 100% charge	3	Defective when battery fails to hold a 40% charge	3	Defective if can not hold power for less than 60 minutes	1	When battery will not hold a charge

**RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Phase 2 Evaluation**

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple Computer		HP		
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4		
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes		
TRAINING	40	40		41		41	41		
Subsections:									
Initial staff training	8	8	At local schools, no CCSD personnel required for training, differentiated instruction	8	Differentiated training, no CCSD personnel required for training, offered at local schools	6	Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver training. Training delivered to each school could impact timeline. Planning and managing tech rich classroom not addresses until Phase II. Training not differentiated.	5	Training conducted during school concerns about # of sessions provided, GroupWise training not included.
Initial Student/Parent Training	10	10	Excellent tutorial system, after hours training at each school, 1 CCSD per session to support, ESL support / handouts provided, good ratio of students to trainer	10	At local schools, after hours and weekends, no CCSD personnel required, ESL provisions provided, strong trainer/student ratio	7	Relies heavily on CCSD personnel to deliver training	3	Virtual training proposed, face to face training would have additional cost, class sessions up to 250 participants
Annual New Staff and Student Training	2	2	Will provide training to 700 additional teachers/year	2	Provide all new staff and student training	0.5	Apple provides no training to new staff/students. Plan to be developed w/CCSD utilizing a Train the Trainer model.	1	Plan provided but not adequate for number of new staff/students
Technology Support Staff Training	5	5	Provide training for District or local school staff at no additional cost, tutorial available online, Premier Access certification available for cost	4	Think Vantage tools - 5 days of training for 20 tech leads, plan depends heavily on IBM providing school support	5	8 days of training for 3 groups of 17, additional training will be provided on an as needed basis	4	Web based - same training as for HP self maintainers, good kfrage strategies
Ongoing Curriculum Technology Integration Training	15	15	Strong link to CCSD standards, includes a detailed three year plan, train the trainer - building capacity model, admin tracking tool, digital portfolio pilot at 4 schools, Instructional Quality Toolkit to develop local school professional development plans	7	Linked to national standards only, train the trainer model offered to adequate if trainers, excellent leadership courses, plan is not adequate in providing best practices & emerging technology courses for teachers	12.5	Delivery plan for ongoing training for train the trainers is not clear - Learning Development Center's purpose unclear	11	Content linked to CCSD standards, detailed plan of delivery was unclear. Connected University or online customized courses recommended, yearly conferences offered to limited # of CCSD personnel

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Phase 2 Evaluation

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple Computer		HP		
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4		
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes		
6.8 Program Instructional Evaluation	10	10	Clearly indicates research groups have completed similar projects of scope/scale for multiple organizations. Proposed projects clearly demonstrate understanding of importance for providing immediate & long-term info to the public & CCSD. Well-defined 3 phased timeline to begin before deployment to teachers or students. All research/eval components tied to Dell's communication plan. Phase 1, 2, & 3 include the following annual activities: questionnaires, surveys, student test data, quantitative & qualitative data analysis, semi-annual & annual draft conclusions/recommendations. Longitudinal analysis following cohorts of HS & MS students across 2 yrs. achievement gains, attitudes, skills, behaviors, & post-secondary education (as relevant). Teachers/administrators - changes in professional routines & productivity, school-home communication. Large scale quantitative analysis of questions determined important by CCSD. Pre & posttest data available each yr. Student achievement data from CCSD will be compared to comparable Districts in GA. Offered a 3rd research opportunity - H	10	Mets Assoc references provided w/ pre-quantification support that Mets has experience w/ similar projects of scope/scale. Proposal well grounded in standard, acceptable evaluation practices. Evaluations will be formative (process) & summative (outcomes) using multiple measures over multiple groups to include students, teachers, administrators, parents, & other key stakeholders. Data sources will be qualitative & quantitative. Formative evaluation data will be project documentation, field observations, focus groups, individual interviews, and written surveys. Mets will use a comparison school design in which CCSD schools' state assessment results are compared to schools outside of CCSD. All findings will be shared w/ key CCSD staff during quarterly assessment/viewer meetings, giving CCSD opportunity to adjust to meet project goals. Summative evaluation data sources include state data sources & other sources. Mets will meet w/ CCSD to first develop the research evaluation questions to be answered during research period. Data sources will also be defined at that time. Propose	5	Proposes partnership with focal Learning & Performance Support Lab at UGA. Similar project partnerships were not clearly defined and certainly were not as large in scope as the P2L project. Evaluation components limited in scope focusing on achievement in writing, rather than increasing achievement across curriculum areas through the use of writing. Plan includes a 3-part implementation with subsequent application/changes from traditional practices and impact on student outcomes. Evaluation plan was general in nature and did not include specific data collections. Proposal provides for a 20% sampling of CCSD population, additional cost for full population. Evaluation plan is independent of training plan and community communication plan. Evaluation concludes at the end of year 3 (need a minimum of 3 full years use by HS students & 2 full years use by MS). Plan provides periodic assessments of progress (qtr.) to CCSD.	3	The program instructional evaluation plan proposed is very limited in scope. The proposed study design only includes 450 middle school students and 450 high school students at four CCSD schools. The instructional evaluation plan is proposed to start in year 2 for HS students and in year 3 for MS students. The response lacks the necessary details to ascertain if this study is a longitudinal study. The information provided to the committee at this time indicated it is not a longitudinal study. Stratified samples of teacher performance assessments are mentioned in the proposal; however, details as to how this information would be gathered or used is not defined. In addition, the study does not include any sampling of CCSD parents as to the success of the Power to Learn program.

RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Phase 2 Evaluation

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple Computer		HP		
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4		
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes		
6.5 Insurance	10	10	Meets requirements. \$40 premium/\$100 deductible.	10	Meets and exceeds requirements: \$40 premium/\$100 deductible. Collects premiums. Accepts installment payments from students qualifying for free & reduced. All risk includes broken screens. Local claims processing, local repairs.	0	Names Sateware as insurer. Does not meet 3 requirements. No guarantee of premium limit to \$50. All risk - excludes damages from environmental causes (i.e. heat, cold, dampness, dryness. Required CCSD to collect of premiums.	0	Did not meet RFP requirements: Payment of premium is due up front. If financed over 4 years, exceeds premium limit. Limits coverage for broken screens to 1 per year
6.9 Disposal Plan	2	2	Provided	2	Provided	2	Provided	2	Provided
6.10 Safety and Security System	2	0	Does not meet requirement. Not critical to success of program.	2	Meets requirement for additional cost. Not critical to success of program.	2	Meets requirement with Apple Remote Desktop 2 application.	2	Meets requirement for cost of \$17.88 per unit. Not critical to success of program.
6.11 Value Added Options	5	4	Comprehensive plan indicates willingness to partner with CCSD for successful project. Certification for Tech Staff at site. Log/jack tracking software included with ins. \$100 deduction waived if unit stolen; EDTV programming Instructional Quality Toolkit Plan provides 2 program evaluations including communication, accountability and instructional.	4	Communication Plan Hardware Durability Rapid Restore Access IBM Button	3	Life Size Communication Plan Other curricular software submitted by Apple has not been determined to be of value to CCSD No Technical Value Add Provided	0	No Technical Value Add Provided Curriculum software included with computers does not meet CCSD's needs
6.14 ISP Options for Home Use	1	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates	1	Basic Dial up rates
TECHNICAL SPECIFICATIONS	30	26		25		5		7	
Subsections:									
6.12 Technical Specifications - Meets min. requirements	10	8	No built-in mic, Battery life is less than 7 hours	9	Battery Life is less than 7 hours	6	No PC/MCIA Slot, Battery life less than 7 hours. Wireless b/g only	7	No Built-in mic, battery life less than 7 hours. Wireless b/g
Physical evaluation of equipment	4	2	No built-in mic	2	Bulky external battery	2	External cord for video	2	Battery hard to remove, no built-in mic
Equipment Performance evaluation	8	8	Based on Committee developed evaluation	8	Based on Committee developed evaluation	4	Based on Committee developed evaluation	7	Based on Committee developed evaluation

**RFP 25-04 Power To Learn
Phase 2 Evaluation**

Vendor:	Dell		IBM		Apple Computer		HP	
Current Overall Rank:	1		2		3		4	
Area of Evaluation	Points Possible	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	Points Awarded	Notes	
6.13 Network Impact Analysis	8	8	Comprehensive plan and site surveys at no additional cost	6	Provides 160 hours of engineer time, CCSD to pay for surveys	3	Will provide help evaluating WAN links only	
Subtotal	160	150	94%	141	89%	98	61%	
Subsections:	40	21.30		21.58		40	21.58	
Lease/Purchase Cost for Total Solution	40	24.30	3-yr \$643.45 per year, 4-yr \$597.59 per year	31.58	3-yr \$526.98 per year, 4-yr \$458.39 per year	40	Original 12- month: 3-yr \$419.27 per yr, 4-yr \$363.14 per yr All 12- month: 3-yr \$515.84 per yr, 4-yr \$413.14 per yr	
Total Cost of Ownership Considerations, Individual Vendors			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Data collection resources for program instructional evaluation. Collection of insurance premiums. Wireless for initial teacher training? 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surveys / network impact analysis at 37 schools Asset system not web-based 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Screen images not covered in any warranty option Platform Shift Dual network platform support Testing instructional existing software for OS X compatibility Additional Training on new OS platform Space for Proposed Servers (Schools/DataCtr) Adding File Maker Pro software as substitute for MS Access Battery Charging Stations Training Plan requires CCSD staff to provide some of the training Training Plan requires CCSD facilities at initial staff & student training sessions. 	
Total Cost of Ownership Considerations - All Vendors			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summer Refresh On-Site Tech Support Staff Space in Schools for Tech Support Equipment for Tech Support Printing solution Infrastructure upgrades (separate SPLOST initiative) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summer Refresh On-Site Tech Support Staff Space in Schools for Tech Support Equipment for Tech Support Printing solution Infrastructure upgrades (separate SPLOST initiative) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summer Refresh On-Site Tech Support Staff Space in Schools for Tech Support Equipment for Tech Support Printing solution Infrastructure upgrades (separate SPLOST initiative) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summer Refresh On-Site Tech Support Staff Space in Schools for Tech Support Equipment for Tech Support Printing solution Infrastructure upgrades (separate SPLOST initiative) 		
Total Points	200	174.30		172.58		138.00	106.36	

Includes latest revised pricing from each vendor as of 12/13/04. Pricing points have been allocated at this stage based on the 4-yr leasing options from all vendors. At this time, the Apple, Dell and HP original configurations are being used for the purpose of points assignment.

Pricing formula: Lowest Price/Next Lowest Price X Points = Score